Вестник РУДН, Серия: ФИЛОСОФИЯ

http://journals.rudn.ru/philosophy

https://doi.org/10.22363/2313-2302-2024-28-2-450-466

EDN: UXKNAU

Research Article / Научная статья

Yūsuf Khāṣṣ-Hājib on Virtuous Leadership: A Medieval Turko-Islamic Philosophical Discourse

Darkhan M. Nauruzbayev , Zhakipbek A. Altayev, Nurtas T. Abdimomynov

Al-Farabi Kazakh National University, 39/47 Masanchi St., 050012, Almaty, Republic of Kazakhstan ⊠nauruzbayevd@bk.ru

Abstract. The article examines Yūsuf Khāṣṣ-Hājib's magnum opus, Kutadgu Bilig, to analyze his thoughts on virtue ethics and leadership. Grounded in the ancient Mirror for Princes1 genre, the didactic poem Kutadgu Bilig reflects the medieval Turko-Islamic philosophical discourse on virtuous leadership, wherein the main characters of the poem engage in profound discussions about justice, morality, and wisdom by elucidating their significance in governance. Moreover, the article has revealed how Kutadgu Bilig expounds on the essential role of virtues in nurturing future political rulers as virtuous leaders through the cultivation of virtue ethics. As the paper finds, virtue ethics takes a central position in Yūsuf's teachings, and the Kutadgu Bilig was written to illuminate the path to wisdom in governance and ethical decision-making for young political rulers. The first part of the paper examines Yūsuf's thoughts on virtuous leadership and his utopian ideas about "the virtuous ruler" (Kün Togdi) in the Kutadgu Bilig by focusing on his qualities. In the second part, the paper analyzes the positive effects of virtuous leadership according to Yūsuf's perspectives. Special attention is given to Yūsuf's four principles in the Kutadgu Bilig — Justice, Fortune (Happiness), Wisdom (or Intellect), and Contentment, which are examined in the context of virtue ethics. Moreover, the article attempted, so far as it has been able, to trace Yūsuf's ideas on virtuous leadership with the thoughts of the Islamic philosopher al-Fārābī.

Keywords: virtue ethics, Turko-Islamic political thought, al-Fārābī, Yūsuf Khāṣṣ-Hājib, the *Kutadgu Bilig*

Article history:

The article was submitted on 19.12.2023 The article was accepted on 31.01.2024

¹ The *Mirror for Princes* [Latin: specula principum] is a literary genre of didactic political writings in which political ideas and basic principles of conduct were expressed as advice to a political ruler.

[©] Nauruzbayev D.M., Altayev Zh.A., Abdimomynov N.T., 2024

This work is licensed under a Creative Commons Attribution 4.0 International License

For citation: Nauruzbayev DM, Altayev ZhA, Abdimomynov NT. Yūsuf Khāṣṣ-Hājib on Virtuous Leadership: A Medieval Turko-Islamic Philosophical Discourse. *RUDN Journal of Philosophy.* 2024;28(2):450–460. https://doi.org/10.22363/2313-2302-2024-28-2-450-466

Юсуф Хас-Хаджиб Баласагуни о добродетельном лидерстве: Средневековый тюрко-исламский философский дискурс в «Кутадгу Билиг»

Д.М. Наурузбаев С. Ж. Алтаев, Н.Т. Абдимомынов

Казахский национальный университет имени аль-Фараби Республика Казахстан, 050012, г. Алматы, ул. Масанчи, д. 39/47 ⊠nauruzbayevd@bk.ru

Аннотация: В статье рассматривается выдающееся произведение Юсуфа Хас-Хаджиба Баласагуни "Кутадгу Билиг" с целью анализировать его мысли об этике добродетели и лидерстве. Дидактическая поэма "Кутадгу Билиг", основанная на древнем жанре "Зеркала для принцев" ("Mirrors for Princes"), отражает средневековый тюрко-исламский философский дискурс о добродетельном лидерстве, в котором главные герои поэмы ведут глубокие дискуссии о справедливости, морали и мудрости, разъясняя их значение в контексте политического лидерства. Более того, в статье показано, как Кутадгу Билиг раскрывает важную роль этических и интеллектуальных добродетелей для формирование будущих политических правителей как добродетельных лидеров на основе культивирования этика добродетели. Как отмечается в статье, этика добродетели занимает центральное место в учении Юсуфа, а "Кутадгу Билиг" была написана, чтобы осветить путь к мудрости в эффективном управлении и этическом принятии решений для молодых политических правителей. В первой части статьи рассматривается моральные и этические взгляды Юсуфа в контексте добродетельного лидерство и его утопические взгляды о "добродетельном правителя" (Кюн Тогди) в "Кутадгу Билиг", фокусируясь на его этических и интеллектуальных качествах. Во второй части статьи рассматривается позитивные эффекты добродетельного лидерства с точки зрения Юсуфа. Особое внимание уделяется четырем принципам Юсуфа в "Кутадгу Билиг" — справедливость, счастье, мудрость (или интеллект) и умеренность, которые рассматриваются в контексте этика добродетели. Более того, в статье предпринята попытка, связать идеи Юсуфа о добродетельном лидерстве с мыслями исламского философа аль-Фараби.

Ключевые слова: этика добродетели, средневековая тюрко-исламская политическая мысль, аль-Фараби, Юсуф Баласагуни, Кутадгу Билиг

История статьи:

Статья поступила 19.12.2023 Статья принята к публикации 31.01.2024 Для цитирования: *Nauruzbayev D.M., Altayev Zh.A., Abdimomynov N.T.* Yūsuf Khāṣṣ-Hājib on Virtuous Leadership: A Medieval Turko-Islamic Philosophical Discourse // Вестник Российского университета дружбы народов. Серия: Философия. 2024. Т. 28. № 2. С. 450–460. https://doi.org/10.22363/2313-2302-2024-28-2-450-466

Introduction

There is a long tradition in Eastern and Western moral philosophies of defining political leadership in terms of virtues and character. The Greek idea of virtue ἀρετή, which stands for excellence, had played a central role in Western moral philosophies [1. P. 145], and it influenced Islamic philosophy as well as medieval Turkic wisdom tradition. Ancient Greek philosophers emphasized the importance of the virtues of political rulers to build a perfect state [city]. In the Laws, Plato claims, "Where supreme power in a man joins hands with wise judgment and self-restraint, there you have the birth of the best political system" [2. 712a]. In the Politics, Aristotle believes the rule of the virtuous political ruler will be beneficial because "the virtuous contribute the most to a true polis" [3. 3.9.1281a1–6; 4. P. 4]. This idea stands behind the paradox of the philosopher-king proposed by Plato. In the *Republic*, Plato argues that cities will have no rest from evils until philosophers govern as kings or those who genuinely and adequately philosophize hold political power [5. 473c-d]. This idea was later developed by the Islamic thinker al-Fārābī in the 10th century AD [6; 7. P. 1–18; 8–10; 11. P. 375–376]. He was convinced by the idea that "the first ruler" [ar-ra'īs al-|awwal] should be a wise man [hakīm], philosopher [$faylas\bar{u}f$], and prophet [nabiyy] who has achieved his perfection, "holds the perfect rank of humanity," "has reached the highest degree of felicity," and who possesses twelve natural in-born qualities [12. P. 26–27; 13. P. 59–60]. In the al-Madīna al-Fādila, al-Fārābī describes twelve must-have qualities of the founder of "Virtuous City," including ethical virtues such as justice ('adl) and moral truth, high moral dignity, contempt of worldly things, and intellectual virtues such as intelligence, a good comprehensive faculty, scholarly talent, excellent mode of expression, good memory skills, and sharp-witted [13. P. 59-60]. We argue that these ideas have also been taken over by the prominent Turkic political thinker and poet Yūsuf Khāss-Hājib in the 11th century AD. In his work, Kutadgu Bilig, Yūsuf was also convinced by the idea that the political rulers "must be intelligent and wise, generous and virtuous" [14. Line 1951]. Yūsuf writes, "If the ruler is virtuous, the citizens will also be on their good behavior" [14. Line 887]. He also claims, "If the ruler is virtuous, his people grow wealthy, and the state prospers" [14. Lines 888–895]. He states, "How fortunate a time for the people in his reign, so long as their ruler is virtuous and righteous" [14. Line 1083]. Yūsuf's work contains philosophical discourse based on the medieval Turkic-Islamic wisdom tradition of virtue ethics. During the dialogues, the main characters of the poem analyze moral truth, justice, the essence of virtues for political ends, moral values, and virtues for political rulers to build "a Just state."

The Kutadgu Bilig was written by Yūsuf Khāss-Hājib during the era of Qarakhanids² in Central Asia. The Qarakhanid Turks were the first among the Turkic people to declare Islam as a state religion in the 10th century AD. The adoption of Islam by the Qarakhanid Turks was a crucial factor that profoundly affected the political ideology, culture, and philosophy of the medieval Turkic world. During this transitional period, the prominent works of Turkic scholars were published based on Turko-Islamic cultures. These are Dīwān Lughāt al-Turk by Mahmūd al-Kashgari and *Kutadgu Bilig* by Yūsuf Khāss-Hājib in the 11th century AD, which played a profound role in shaping Turko-Islamic culture and philosophy of Central Asia. While Mahmūd al-Kashgari, a great lexicographer of the Turkish dialects, contributed to the areas of linguistic scholarship, Yūsuf Khāss-Hājib, a great Turkic poet and thinker contributed to the development of Turko-Islamic literature and philosophy by synthesizing Turkic wisdom tradition with Islamic thoughts. Moreover, Yūsuf significantly influenced the development of Turko-Islamic political philosophy by presenting his ideas about royal wisdom, justice, equality, and humanism, which were previously explored by Islamic philosophers. Although the Turkic traditions on royal wisdom and virtue ethics were first recorded in the Orkhon inscriptions dating from the eighth century [15; 16. P. 87–95], the *Kutadgu Bilig* was the first major literary and philosophical work (containing 13290 lines) written in the Turkic language [17. P. 3–9; 18. P. 132]. According to researchers, Yūsuf's political philosophy propounds unique virtue ethics rooted in medieval Turko-Islamic wisdom traditions [17. P. 3–10; 18. P. 131–141; 19; 20; 21. P. 495–517; 22. P. 8–15].

Although the literary aspects of the *Kutadgu Bilig* have been studied for a long time, Yūsuf's philosophical thoughts on virtuous leadership still require further study and accurate interpretation. It is unclear why Yūsuf believes that virtues are essential for leadership. What is the reason for Yūsuf's emphasis on the necessity of a virtuous ruler in Turkic society? What is a virtuous ruler according to Yūsuf's philosophy? Lastly, what are the effects of a virtuous ruler, according to Yūsuf's perspective? To answer these questions, the article aims to examine Yūsuf's thoughts on virtuous leadership, the essence of virtues for political ends, the ethical and intellectual virtues that political rulers should have, the abstract principles that he uses in the poem, and the effects of virtuous leadership according to Yūsuf's perspectives.

Yūsuf Khāṣṣ-Hājib and the *Kutadgu Bilig*. Background of the Consideration

Yūsuf Khāṣṣ-Hājib, mostly referred to as Yūsuf Balasaguni (1018–?), is a prominent Turkic poet and philosopher from Balasaghun, lived in Kashgar during the Qarakhanid era. He lived at a time when the Qarakhanids, as other Turkic dynasties — the Ghaznavids and the Seljuks had gained the dominant position in

_

² The Qarakhanid Dynasty was the first Muslim Turkic dynasty that ruled Central Asia from the 9th to the beginning of the 13th century.

the political life of Islam [23. P. 2]. As we mentioned earlier, the declaration of Islam as an official religion by the Oarakhanid dynasty in the middle of the 1 0th century AD was a crucial milestone in the political history and culture of the Qarakhanid Turks. During this transitional period, in 1069 or 1070, Yūsuf Khāss-Hājib wrote his famous work, Kutadgu Bilig, and presented it to the court of the King of the East, Tavgach Bugra Khan [14. preface, line 60]. According to S.N. Ivanov, the *Kutadgu Bilig* is an ethical and didactic poem that reflects the moral code of that time. The characters, events, and moral and ethical ideals in the poem are associated with the political system, culture, and ideology of the settled Turkic state, still firmly preserving the memory of its nomadic "prehistory" [24. P. 520]. However, A.N. Kononov argues that the *Kutadgu Bilig* is not just a book of dry ethical and didactic instructions, but it is also a profound philosophical treatise that examines the meaning and importance of human life and defines the behavioral norms and duties of a person in society (especially of political leaders — the authors) [21. P. 507]. Starr admits that the *Kutadgu Bilig* follows a fairly typical tale in the pattern of Persian and Arabic Mirrors for Princes genre. However, he also recognizes that the real substance of the poem is the author's allegorical, ethical, political, and religious themes, which are interwoven throughout the book [25. P. 327]. A. N. Kononov claims that the political and cultural challenges in the Oarakhanid state during the transitional period played a critical role in the creation of this work. Perhaps Yūsuf Khāss-Hājib felt an urgent need to reinforce the moral foundation of the struggling society [21. P. 509]. We agree with A.N. Kononov's opinions. Being an ideologist of the Oarakhanid state, Yūsuf sought to strengthen the moral basis of the political power of the Turkic rulers after the Oarakhanid Turks officially declared Islam as a state religion in the middle of the 10th century AD. It seems there was an urgent need for a poem like the Kutadgu Bilig. He wrote his poem to illuminate the path to the wisdom of governance and public policy for Turkic political rulers during the transitional period [21. P. 506; 22. P. 12]. Moreover, he also aimed to integrate Islamic thoughts into the Turkic royal ideology and wisdom traditions. As per Ganieva, Yūsuf's Kutadgu Bilig was a highly developed philosophical and aesthetic system that, on the one hand, was closely connected with the Turkic civilization; on the other hand, it was under the influence of Islamic philosophy [26. P. 44]. Yūsuf Khāṣṣ-Hājib also emphasizes the importance of justice and wisdom for political leaders to bring happiness to people as Islamic philosophers. He also sets forth "a virtue ethics" for "a virtuous ruler," which is very similar to the ideas of al-Fārābī. Yūsuf's work Kutadgu Bilig was based on the Turkic as well as Islamic traditions of seeking answers to fundamental questions such as how to build a just society, how to achieve happiness, and how to become a virtuous ruler, which had been discussed by Eastern peripatetics such as al-Fārābī, Ibn Sina, Ibn Rushd, and others. Even German orientalist Otto Alberts claims that Yūsuf Khāss-Hājib was a student of the great scholar Ibn Sina. According to Alberts, this corresponds to Ibn Sina's distinction between reason, which knows good from evil, and practical reason, which chooses good [27. P. 328]. Yūsuf addressed the question of happiness in the

same vein as his predecessor al-Fārābī, who stated that "happiness is an ultimate good" and that it is the ruler's responsibility to ensure the real earthly goodness of their people through justice and laws [28. P. 113]. Both philosophers considered that only a just and virtuous ruler can bring happiness to his people and create a just society. Robert Dankoff claims that the *Kutadgu Bilig* was written to combine Turkic and Persian-Islamic wisdom traditions [16. P. 87–95].

The Kutadgu Bilig consists of dialogues between the four main characters of the poem, each representing abstract principles (virtues). At the beginning of the poem. Yūsuf informs us that his work is based on four principles (virtues), each of which is represented by the main characters of the poem: King Kün Togdi -(Rising Sun, lit. the sun has risen) stands for *Justice*; Vizier Ay Toldi — (Full Moon, lit. the moon is full) stands for Fortune (Happiness); Sage Ögdülmis — (Highly Praised, lit. Praised) represents Wisdom (Intellect); Ascetic (Dervish) Odgurmis — (Wide Awakened, lit. Awakened) represents Contentment (Kanaat)³ (or Man's Last End) [29. Lines 65–71]. Their philosophical discourse covers three main topics: the significance of virtues (such as goodness, justice, intelligence and knowledge, temperance, and generosity), the inevitability of death, and the need to think about the afterlife and the futility of worldly temptations, the impermanence of vain goods, the need to serve God instead and about the impermanence of vain goods. Yūsuf also compares the concepts of good and evil by emphasizing the significance of moral choices. The moral choice depends on different factors, including an individual's knowledge and ability. Moreover, human virtues are fundamental concepts in the philosophical system of Yūsuf. The main character, King Kün Togdi, advised his vizier, Ay Toldi, to live in a virtuous way so that they would be remembered in the memory of people as a good person. This is further supported by the righteous ideas, which suggest that a person who has experienced evil but remains still faithful to good will always be chosen as a friend. At the end of the poem, Ay Toldi and Odgurmis die, who represent "Happiness" and "Contentment," respectively. Kün Togdi and Ögdülmis, who stand for "Justice" and "Wisdom," remain alive. The author's intention in the poem is apparent, as he considers justice and wisdom to be the most crucial and everlasting virtues. Happiness and contentment, on the other hand, depend on justice and wisdom. King Kün Togdi's power in the poem embodies justice, and the author claims that wise and just men possess the true essence of virtue ethics. Therefore, the author suggests that happiness and contentment, while desirable virtues are only possible when accompanied by wisdom and justice.

The utopian model of a Virtuous Ruler in the Kutadgu Bilig

Islamic philosopher al-Fārābī argues that a specific type of ruler is needed for a "Virtuous City" to prosper and flourish [30. P. 152]. Similarly, Yūsuf also writes

-

³ According to the Namangan manuscript of the Kutadgu Bilig, the fourth principle is *Contentment [Kanaat]*. In this article, we have chosen this version.

that a state will prosper and its citizens will be happy and behave well when it is governed by a "just and virtuous ruler" [14. Lines 886–887, 895, 1083].

In his work, Yūsuf illustrates King Kün Togdi (Rising Sun) as a model of a "just ruler" who brings happiness to his people. The main quality of Kün Togdi is justice [29. Line 65], in which Yūsuf believes justice is an essential virtue that bestows happiness upon the citizens of a state. The author states that the name of the main character, Kün Togdi, stands for the virtue of justice. In the poem, Kün Togdi explains that a sage gave him this name, which reflects his character. He is always full of justice, just like the sun. His justice is undiminishing, and his deeds and words are constant for all citizens as the sun sheds its light on all creation without being diminished. His laws span the land, and the state flourishes; as the sun rises and warms the earth, countless flowers begin to bloom. His actions are fair and impartial to everyone, as the sun doesn't differentiate between clean and unclean actions. Finally, he is consistent and never alters as the sun shines its light on everything and does not lose its brightness [14. Lines 826–835]. Kün Togdi was a wise and intelligent ruler who ruled his country for many years. His fame knew no bounds. He was renowned for his fair and just deeds, as he was strict and truthful. He was like fire to evil people, and his enemies feared him. Kün Togdi was a brave ruler who always acted in accordance with justice and truth, and as a result, his reputation grew stronger [14. P. 53–54].

Although Kün Togdi, who was the "most sagacious" and" intelligent prince" with "a high level of virtue" and "righteous nature," invited all the people who were wise and intelligent, loyal, honest, and upright to his court. He raised all the outstanding individuals and attracted them to state affairs [14. Lines 405–406, 423– 424]. This fact demonstrates that Kün Togdi is never alone in his affairs, as he always had sage people with loyal, honest, and upright characters around him. Yūsuf claims, "The prince needs capable aides and wise statesmen, individuals who know their job well." Kün Togdi relied on wise and intelligent men and their knowledge in all his endeavors. Being surrounded by these people who can see and hear everything, the ruler is well-informed about state affairs. He maintained the state with moral principles and "with manly virtue befitting" [14. P. 53]. Kün Togdi governed his country exactly this way with justice and wisdom, which earned him an increasing amount of respect and admiration from his people. As a result, people from across the world reached out to him in order to experience his benevolence and generosity. Kün Togdi himself was content, and his people were filled with joy and happiness.

Yūsuf metaphorically illustrates King Kün Togdi's leadership style, which is based on justice and equality. Kün Togdi illustrates the three pillars of power by using his three-legged stool as an example [14. Lines 800–808]. He states that just like the three-legged stool, the three pillars of power should be kept straight, and straightness leads to justice. Thus, Kün Togdi relies on balancing these three pillars of power when governing the country. The first pillar is symbolized by a knife. The King says, "I cut the case as if with a knife, and I do not make the plaintiff wait" [14. Line 811]. However, he settles a case based on law alone without regard to

whether a man is noble or enslaved, which emphasizes his severity and justice. According to King, the next pillar is sugar, which is needed so that "he who has experienced oppression at my gates will find the truth of the law." The third symbol is wormwood, which is "for the wrongdoer to drink, who flees from what is right." When such a man comes to him to dispute, he hands down judgment, and "it is bitter for him as though he were drinking wormwood" [14. Lines 812–814]. Moreover, he explains that he judges them equally, whether he is his relative or a stranger. He claims that *justice* is the cornerstone of sovereignty, and where the ruler is just, there is life and prosperity. Furthermore, he states, "Happy the realm when it enjoys righteous sovereignty" [14. Lines 818–822].

Yūsuf describes King Kün Togdi as a model of a "virtuous ruler" who would be able to make a difference in society. In the poem, Yūsuf explains to young princes, "Two sorts of noble men there are, one the prince, the other the sage, head of humankind. All others are like cattle." In this case, the prince is a symbol of justice, a sage the author sees as the true essence of man. Then he asks, now tell me plainly which group you belong to? Then he gives advice. Choose the first or the second and avoid the third! While the first grasps the sword and governs the people, the second grasps the pen and clears the path to success [14. Lines 265–267]. Yūsuf Khāṣṣ-Hājib argues that political rulers should strive to embody virtues such as wisdom, justice, righteousness, temperance, courage, kindness, generosity, and honesty [14. Lines 1921–2180].

Virtues as Qualities of Character in the *Kutadgu Bilig* and the *al-Madīna al-Fāḍila:* Comparative Analysis

In this part, we would like to comparatively analyze the qualities of the first ruler of the "Virtuous City" in the al-Madīna al-Fāḍila by al-Fārābī and those embodied in the Kutadgu Bilig by Yūsuf. Al-Fārābī argues that the ruler of the "Virtuous city" should possess an inborn predisposition to be a ruler, and he should also have acquired habits and attitudes of will for rulership, which will develop in a man whose nature is predisposed for it [13. P. 59–60]. Then, al-Fārābī illustrates the twelve qualities that the "first ruler" of the Virtuous City should have. Similarly, Yūsuf writes, "Who would be a noble prince must hold to noble virtues" [14. Line 2122]. Yūsuf also believes that being a ruler requires an inborn nature [noble birth] followed by bravery, courage, intelligence, wisdom, and generosity [14. Line 1949–50]. He claims that some rulers may possess the title of ruler, but if he does not have ethical virtues, he will be called "ignoble" among the citizens [14. Line 2122]. Moreover, Yūsuf believes that both ethical and intellectual virtues are essential for bringing happiness to people. Like al-Fārābī, Yūsuf also emphasizes the inborn disposition of a ruler. He claims, "When God gives someone princely rule, He gives him the mind and heart corresponding to the task" [14. Lines 1932–1936]. He states that when a child is born with a sound mind, he "starts out with sound capital to invest." His mind matures as he grows and learns, and "he learns whatever he requires until he gains wisdom." Eventually, he becomes a wise counselor, and his profit fills the kingdom [14. Lines 1815–1820]. However, he

believes intelligence is an inborn virtue; it "grows out of one's inborn nature" [14. Line 1823]. Moreover, Yūsuf believes there are two types of good men who exist, but only one truly holds on to the good way. The first type is good by heredity and behaves in an upright and true manner. The second type of man is only good by imitation, and if he keeps bad company, he will become bad himself [14. Lines 873–874]. Although Yūsuf emphasizes the inborn disposition to be a good ruler, he claims "all the virtues except intelligence are learned, and when they are, then wisdom is attained" [14. Line 1683].

Furthermore, he argues that all virtues, except intelligence, are learned: "Wisdom, like virtue and good manners, is learned" [14. Line 1823]. Particularly, wisdom is not innate in man, but it is acquired gradually; once a man has acquired it, all his affairs prosper, and he rises to the position of honor [14. Lines 1678–79]. In his work, Yūsuf emphasizes the importance of knowledge and education in transforming society. He believes education is essential for creating an ideal society and achieving personal perfection and happiness. According to Yūsuf, intellect is an essential characteristic of the human given by God. However, wisdom has made humanity great, and knowledge has helped us to understand many aspects of the universe [14. Lines 148–152]. A–Fārābī believes the natural disposition to control behavior is only effective if a person is properly directed and developed. He even puts the role of education higher than natural predisposition and abilities, apparently bearing in mind that a person's personality is formed depending on sociocultural conditions. Al-Fārābī believes that whether a leader is good or bad depends on his education [28. P. 121].

In the *al-Madīna al-Fāḍila*, al-Fārābī describes twelve must-have qualities for "the first ruler" (*ar-ra ʾīs al-|awwal*) [13. P. 59–60]. In this list, he mentions several ethical virtues like justice, moral truth, high moral dignity, and contempt of worldly things (asceticism). Similarly, Yūsuf illustrates in the *Kutadgu Bilig* the four abstract principles (virtues), such as *Justice, Fortune [Happiness], Wisdom [or Intellect], and Contentment* [14. Lines 65–71, 353–58]. He also states, "of myriad virtues, of vices few (for a ruler — the authors), to hold his name and keep his hue" [14. Line 1956]. Therefore, Yūsuf mentions around seventeen ethical and intellectual virtues for rulers, such as *Justice, Wisdom, Intelligence, Courage, Generosity, Temperance, Helpfulness, Gracefulness, Modesty, Uprightness, God-Fearing and Devoutness, Contentment, Purity, Kindness, Truthfulness, Forgiveness, Prone to Shame [14. Lines 1921–2175]. He states that any person who possesses these virtues deserves the name of "ruler" and a high position in the state. The virtuous prince is the head of state citizens; from him, every virtue is expected [14. P. 110].*

Ethical virtues. Yūsuf's ethical virtues also converge with al-Fārābī's virtues, such as justice, moral truth, high moral dignity, and contempt of worldly things (asceticism).

Justice: It is a primary virtue in al-Fārābī's and Yūsuf's political thoughts. According to al-Fārābī, a ruler should defend and maintain justice and what is right. He should be against the humiliation and injustice. The ruler should lead the citizens

to overthrow injustice and unfairness and prevent them from acting wickedly [13. P. 59–60]. Al-Fārābī believes that justice, along with contentment, courage, and generosity, are ethical virtues belonging to the striving part of the soul [28. P. 179]. Yūsuf also claims that justice is the foundation of sovereignty. He believes "where the prince is just, there is life and prosperity" and "the root and base of the princely rule are justice and equity." People will be happy if they enjoy righteous sovereignty [14. Lines 819–821]. He states, "If the prince dispenses justice, he keeps his realm in good order and causes its sun to shine" [14. Lines 2014–2020]. He claims that a ruler who desires to enjoy a long rule must promote justice and protect citizens [14. Line 2032].

Moral truth: Al-Fārābī states that the ruler should value truth and truthful people; conversely, he should condemn untruthful people [13. P. 59–60]. Yūsuf notes that the ruler "should be truthful in word and sincere in deed"; if the ruler is truthful, the citizens will trust in him and share fortune with him [14. Lines 2038–2040]. He also states that the ruler "should have a truthful tongue and an honest heart," and there is no hope for the ruler with a treacherous heart and no profit from him for the citizens [14. Lines 2010–2014].

Asceticism: Al-Fārābī believes that the ruler must be born as an ascetic with no desire to enjoy luxuries or condemn worldly things [13. P. 59–60]. Yūsuf believes that the good man is not one who desires his own pleasure or wealth but one who seeks the happiness of the citizens [14. Lines 3928–3932]. He states that the rulers "must keep their actions pure and straight" since the ruler's actions make a prosperous way for the citizens [14. Lines 2110–2111].

High moral dignity: Al-Fārābī claims that the ruler must value honor and should be broad—minded and generous [13. P. 59–60]. Yūsuf believes the ruler must be generous, just, and "a paragon of virtue among men", and should value the honor and dignity of the people [14. Lines 2168–2173]. He also states that the ruler should be generous "yet keep a humble heart and quiet demeanor" [14. Line 2049].

No desire for wealth: According to al-Fārābī, the ruler should not be blinded by money [al-dirham and al-dinar] and should require only a small amount of money [13. P. 59–60]. Yūsuf states that the ruler should give away his wealth as alms. The ruler should not accumulate a great treasure of gold and silver; the wealth should not be left behind after his death since it may be used for evil purposes by his descendants [14. Lines 5290–5292].

Intellectual Virtues. In the *Kutadgu Bilig*, Yūsuf argues that "all the virtues except intelligence are learned" [14. Line 1683]. He believes individuals should have a natural disposition to acquire intellectual virtues. He states, "If God does not give him a sound mind at birth, he cannot thereafter win any of his desires" [14. Line 1821]. It should be noted that Yūsuf differentiated the distinction between wisdom (*bilig*) and intellect (*ukus*): wisdom is learned, and intellect is inborn [14. Lines 1677, 1815]. He believes, "Wisdom is like alchemy: it accumulates wealth, which is then stored in its palace, the intellect" [14. Line 310]. In part of "On the virtue and benefit of wisdom and intellect" [14. Lines 287–349] of his work, he argues that through intellect, "a man rises in esteem, and through wisdom,

he grows great." These two virtues make a man noble [14. Line 288]. Man is considered rightly noble due to intellect. Countless kinds of virtuous deeds are praised only because they are performed with intellect [14. Line 304]. He argues that wisdom and intellect are noble attributes that ennoble the chosen man. "Wherever there is intellect, there is greatness, and whoever has wisdom achieves nobility" [14. Lines 153–155]. He states that Intellect is a virtue that can lead a man towards his goals and help them enjoy countless desires. An intelligent person provides many benefits to others, while a wise person is very precious. "With intellect, a man accomplishes all his affairs; with wisdom, he can ensure from spoiling his allotted time" [14. Lines 156–161].

Yūsuf emphasizes the significance of wisdom and knowledge for rulers. He states that "with wisdom, the prince must rule the people, and with intellect govern the realm" [14. P. 104]. "When a prince errs, his rule becomes sick and requires treatment. But the only medicine is knowledge and wisdom. [14. P. 104]. He emphasizes that the practical value of knowledge lies in shaping an ideal ruler and building a fair society. The poet greatly values literacy, education, and science. His analysis suggests that the range of knowledge and cultural interests he considers mandatory for an educated person are still relevant today. The Kutadgu Bilig also contains insightful thoughts about education, upbringing, and human culture. He believes that to become a virtuous ruler of society, one must attain a high level of education and knowledge. Concerning education, Yūsuf emphasizes the importance of a person's internal and external perfection and the unity of their physical and spiritual state. Yūsuf argues that if the political ruler gains wisdom, he "became the lord of the age." A wise ruler is virtuous and institutes fair laws. When a ruler errs, his reign becomes sick and requires treatment. However, the only medicine is wisdom and knowledge. He believes that if the sage ruler is close to wisdom, he keeps scientists and intelligent people close to himself. A sage ruler performs his duties carefully and governs the people by applying wisdom in their affairs. He ensures good order in his realm, bringing his people happiness and prosperity [14. Lines 1968–74, 250–55]. In the al-Madīna al-Fādila, al-Fārābī also argues the first ruler should possess inborn intellectual virtues. He mentions that the first ruler "should by nature be good at understanding and perceiving everything said to him," which focuses on the natural disposition of the ruler. He has added essential intellectual virtues to the twelve-qualification list that the first ruler should have had [13. P. 59-60]. Similarly, Yūsuf claims the prince should be intelligent and wise [14. Line 2167], and an intelligent person enjoys the benefits of both worlds and reaches a noble name. The man of intellect and wisdom is the genuinely human choice of humankind and chief of the citizens [14. Lines 2455–2457]. Like al-Fārābī, Yūsuf also argues that the ruler should be intelligent and should possess intellectual virtues such as scholarly talent and learning, effective and ethical thinking, a skilled tongue and power of expression, good memory skills, and good reasoning power [14. Lines 287–349, 1921–2180]. Yūsuf claims that a man should have scholarly talent. A political ruler should have liked to learn and should be able to acquire knowledge and wisdom without any agony. According to Yūsuf,

for political rulers, acquiring knowledge is not only a means to achieve personal perfection but also a way to promote the nation's enlightenment and the state's development. Yūsuf believes that knowledge is the foundation of significant accomplishments and that greatness is achieved through a good understanding of the world around us [14. Line 155]. He argues that a man should have an eloquent tongue and power of expression. He states that an eloquent tongue interprets perfect intellect and wisdom. A power of expression can make a person shine, bringing his esteem and happiness. However, a careless or unwise tongue can bring dishonor to a man. Therefore, he states that the tongue is like a lion crouching on the threshold of a householder, so he warns you to be careful, or it may harm you [14. Lines 162–164].

Effects of Virtues Leadership, according to Yūsuf Khāṣṣ-Hājib's perspectives

According to Yūsuf Khass Hadjb, virtue is a type of trait associated with positive character influences on people, particularly for political rulers in many ways. We identify in the *Kutadgu Bilig* three significant effects of virtuous leadership according to Yūsuf Khāṣṣ-Hājib: establishment of social justice, behaving ethically and experiencing happiness.

Establishment of social justice

The utopian ideas of social justice of the Middle Ages, in which everyone is equal and live in social harmony when "the wolf walked together with the lamb," are presented in the works of Yūsuf. He described social justice as an effect of virtue ethics and virtuous leadership. According to Yūsuf, social justice can only be achieved through the leadership of a just and virtuous ruler who strictly adheres to the law and justice. According to Yūsuf, social justice is achieved when a just ruler, endowed with wisdom and knowledge, governs according to the basis of law, protects his people from external threats, and ensures the safety and well—being of the nation. To achieve this, the ruler should govern the state justly and wisely and carry out actions that benefit the nation. He states that the ruler who desires to enjoy a long rule "must promote justice and protect his people." The territory will increase with justice, and the kingdom will thrive" [14. Line 2033]. He claims, "As long as a prince keeps a steadfast heart and promotes justice, his rule will not collapse but long will stand upright" [14. Line 2036].

Yūsuf emphasizes the social importance of fair governance based on adherence to the rule of law, echoing the words of the sage: "A good thing is princely rule, but better even is justice, which the prince must put into effect. How fortunate a time for the people in his reign, so long as their ruler is virtuous and righteous." [14. Lines 453–454]. According to Yūsuf, the presence of justice in a ruler is a universal good that ensures the happiness and prosperity of the people. King Kün Togdi is described as a just and virtuous ruler due to his nature. By serving the citizens justly and righteously, he ensured his immortality. Yūsuf states that "justice"

and law" are the pillars of an ideal society; if the law decayed, this ideal society would be shaken [14. Line 3463]. He also states that if the ruler is fair and governs his people based on justice, his rule will be long and firm [14. Line 5170]. Yūsuf claims that in order to establish social justice, it is necessary to ensure the dominance of the independent judicial system in the state to implement the rule of law and establish order in the state. He also claims that only the rule of law and the ruler's path is to follow justice [31. P. 22].

Moreover, social justice can be identified when all citizens have equal rights, regardless of whether a person is noble or enslaved. In the *Kutadgu Bilig*, the main character, King Kün–Toğdı, claims, "It is on the basis of right alone that I settle a case, without regard to whether a man is a prince or a slave" [14. Line 809]. He also states, "The root and base of princely rule are justice and equity" [14. Line 821]. He also states, "It makes no difference whether he is my own flesh and blood or a transient stranger: in making judgment, I make no distinction but cut the same in either case. Justice is the foundation-stone of sovereignty; where the ruler is just, there is life and prosperity." [14. Lines 816–819].

Behaving ethically

According to virtue ethics scholars, people who possess virtues tend to behave ethically and enjoy behaving in such a way [32. P. 885; 33; 34]. Yūsuf supports the idea that people, particularly political rulers with virtuous characters, behave ethically. He argues, "Humanity consists of manly virtue, o King, and this virtue should be a ruler's guiding habit. This means recognizing a man's effort on one's behalf and awarding him his due share" [14. Lines 2970–71]. In the poem, one of the main characters, vizier Ay Toldi, who stands for happiness, says to his son Highly Praised: "Instruct son and daughter in wisdom and virtue; then they will be well behaved" [14. Line 1228]. Through the mouth of Ay Toldi, Yūsuf states, "Practice honesty and rectitude, for in this happiness resides... If you desire status and esteem, then keep the straight path open before you. If a man is right-acting and well-behaved, his day will be bright in both worlds" [14. Lines 1289–1294].

Yūsuf says, "When God gives a man good character and good conduct, the world pours its favors upon him." He can enjoy them himself or share them with others. God favors His people with Fortune so that their character and conduct are good. Thus, endowed with virtues by the thousand, man disperses the fog and grasps the realm. What a fine thing is a positive character: it is a people's food and dress. "But when God gives a person a negative character, then Time's arrow harasses him. And if a ruler is so endowed, then all his actions are contrary, and his joy turns to care" [14. Lines 1977–1979].

Experiencing happiness

According to the virtue ethics literature, people can achieve happiness by practicing virtues. Moreover, it has been argued that practicing virtues provides people with a sense of meaning in both their professional and personal lives and

develops their moral capacities, thereby assisting in fulfilling their holistic needs [32. P. 886; 35]. Hackett and Wang argue that if the rulers practice more of the six cardinal leader virtues, such as justice, prudence, humanity, truthfulness, courage, and temperance, they will experience more personal happiness and life satisfaction [32. P. 887]. Similarly, Yūsuf also claims that individuals can achieve happiness through virtue [36. P. 24]. Yūsuf states that the virtuous man will live a happy life in this life and have a place of honor in the afterlife. Those who are generous, straight-dealing, pure, and upright are the owners of that happiness [14. Lines 1975–1976, 2864]. Yūsuf also states that if a man does not know how to hold on to happiness when it comes, she will surely leave. If a man does not know how to profit from what happiness gives, she will take it back. He suggests that happiness will never elude if you stay honest on this path [14. Lines 724–726].

He also claims that happiness is pure; it seeks the individual's purity and supports the pure [14. Line 2105]. He states that a "straight and honorable person attains all his desires" [14. Line 2864]. Moreover, according to Yūsuf, the benefits of virtuous leadership are twofold. He states that people are happy if they have a just ruler; a ruler is happy if he has virtuous citizens [14. Line 1789]. In other words, people's happiness depends on a ruler's virtue. In turn, the ruler's happiness relies on the people's happiness. If the political ruler's actions are fair, the people will benefit from his good deeds, enhancing his honor amongst his citizens. Yūsuf believes that a ruler's legacy could be immortalized by performing good acts in their life. The ruler's happiness lies in the welfare and well-being of the citizens. This is why the citizens will always commemorate his name, making him a virtuous ruler. This is known as the prince's happiness. In his work Tahsīl al-sa'āda, al-Fārābī also believes excellent leadership (siyāsa or ri ʾāsa) cultivates the virtuous character of their citizens and leads them towards happiness [28, P. 14]. Happiness is achieved through a virtuous character, and righteous rulers can show the path to happiness. Individuals can follow their unique ways if they believe the ruler's will is the general path toward happiness. As al-Fārābī and Yūsuf explained, the relationship between ethics and politics offers a comprehensive perspective on transforming society [36. P. 25].

Conclusion

The article examined Yūsuf's idea of the necessity of political rulers to be virtuous to the highest degree. The findings of this study suggest that the *Kutadgu Bilig* provides essential insights into virtue-based leadership theories rooted in the medieval Turko-Islamic wisdom tradition.

As the paper finds, Yūsuf emphasizes the importance of virtues for political rulers. He argues that political rulers must be intelligent, wise, generous, and virtuous" to bring happiness to their people. The paper has underlined the importance of virtues in the *Kutadgu Bilig*. Through the light of belief, Yūsuf had turned virtues such as wisdom, justice, honesty, intelligence, and courage into the main principles of political leadership. Yūsuf, accordingly, stated that a ruler should never use the elements of tyranny, and a just society can only be achieved through

wisdom, intelligence, justice, knowledge, humanity, courage, temperance, and contentment. Yūsuf's thoughts on political leadership assert that all actions of a political leader must benefit the people. In raising the younger generation, the poet emphasizes moral traditions, virtue ethics, and norms, such as the youth's loyalty to their parents' agreements and the responsibility of parents towards their children. Yūsuf dedicated his poem to extolling justice in an individual, particularly in a political ruler. He outlines the ethical and intellectual virtues a just and virtuous ruler should possess to establish a just society and bring happiness to his country.

It can be concluded that thanks to the *Kutadgu Bilig*, the Turkic people established a clear understanding of the idea of a just society and the rule of law in the 11th century AD. *Kutadgu Bilig* has provided a profound understanding of the ethical and moral leadership of medieval Turkic society, and his thoughts about virtues such as justice, wisdom, intelligence, or courage within the context of virtuous leadership underscore the holistic nature of "a virtuous ruler." The ideas of justice, fairness, wisdom, and humanity expressed in poetic form in the *Kutadgu Bilig* have since become an integral part of Turkic culture.

References / Список литературы

- [1] Scalzo G, Akrivou K, Fernandez GM. A Personalist Approach to Business Ethics: New Perspectives for Virtue Ethics and Servant Leadership. *Business Ethics, the Environment & Responsibility*. 2023;(32):145–158. https://doi.org/10.1111/beer.12435
- [2] Plato. *Complete works*. Cooper JM, Hutchinso DS, editors. Indianapolis Cambridge: Hackett Publishing Company; 1997.
- [3] [3] Aristotle. *The Politics. Oxford World's Classics.* Stalley RF, editor. Barker E, translator. Oxford: Oxford University Press; 1998.
- [4] [4] Mittiga R. Ranking the regimes in Aristotle's Politics: The four-principles approach. *The Review of Politics*. 2021;8(1):1–20. https://doi.org/10.1017/S003467052000087X
- [5] Plato. *The Republic*. Reeve CD, editor. Grube GM, translator. Indianapolis: Hackett; 1992.
- [6] [6] Dieterici F. Alfarabi's Philosophische Abhandlungen. Verlag: Outlook Verlag; 2022.
- [7] Walzer R. *Introduction*. In: Walzer R, editor, translator. *Al-Fārābi on the perfect state: Abū Naṣr al-Fārābī's Mabādi ʿĀrā ʿAhl al-Madīna al-Fāḍila*. Oxford: Clarendon Press; 1985. P. 1–18.
- [8] Fakhry M. Al-Farabi and the reconciliation of Plato and Aristotle. *Journal of the History of Ideas*. 1965;26(4):469–478. https://doi.org/10.2307/2708494
- [9] Fakhry M. Aristotelian and Neo-Platonic Tendencies: Al-Fārābī (d. 950), Ibn Sīnā (d. 1037), and Ibn Rushd (d. 1198). In: Fakhry M, editor. Ethical Theories in Islam. Leiden: Brill; 1994. P. 78–92.
- [10] [10] Cotesta V. Al-Farabi II. Political Theory and the Doctrine of the Perfect Imam. In: Gotesto V, editor. The Heavens and the Earth: Graeco-Roman, Ancient Chinese, and Mediaeval Islamic Images of the World. Leiden: Brill; 2021. P. 339–357.
- [11] [11] Lulofs HJD. *The Ruler as Philosopher. A New Interpretation of Fārābī's View*. In: Daiber H, editor. *From the Greeks to the Arabs and Beyond*. V. 2. Islamic Philosophy. Leiden: Brill; 2021. P. 375–394.
- [12] [12] Al-Fārābī A. *Kitāb al-Milla wa-nuṣūṣ uḥrā*. Mahdi M, editor. Beirut: Dār al-Mašriq; 1968.
- [13] [13] Al-Fārābi A. Al-Fārābi on the Perfect State: Abū Naṣr al-Fārābī's Mabādi' Ārā' Ahl al-Madīna al-Fāḍila. Walzer R, editor, translator. Oxford: Clarendon Press; 1985.

- [14] [14] Yūsuf Khāṣṣ-Hājib. *Kutadgu Bilig. Wisdom of Royal Glory. A Turko-Islamic Mirror for Princes*. Dankoff R, editor, translator. Chicago: The University of Chicago Press; 1983.
- [15] [15] Tekin T. A Grammar of Orkhon Turkic. Bloomington: Indiana University; 1968.
- [16] [16] Dankoff R. Inner Asian Wisdom Traditions in the Pre-Mongol Period. *Journal of the American Oriental Society.* 1981;101(1):87–95. https://doi.org/10.2307/602165
- [17] [17] Kononov AN. A Word about Yūsuf from Balasagun and his poem Blessed Knowledge (Wisdom of Royal Glory). *Sovetskaja tjurkologija*. 1970;(4):3–12. (In Russian).
- [18] *Кононов А.Н.* Слово о Юсуфе из Баласагуна и его поэме «Благословенное знание» (Мудрость царской славы) // Советская тюркология. 1970. № 4. С. 3–12.
- [19] [18] Dankoff R. *Introduction to Wisdom of Royal Glory*. In: Dankoff R, editor. *From Mahmud Kasgari to Evliya Celebi Studies in Middle Turkic and Ottoman Literature*. Istanbul: Isis Press; 2008. P. 131–172.
- [20] [19] Yūsuf Has Hâcib. *Kutadgu Bilig II: Tercüme*. Arat RR, editor, translator. Ankara: Türk Tarih Kurumu Yayınları; 1959.
- [21] [20] Dilaçar A. *Bize Mânevî Cihazlanmayı Öğreten: Kutadgu Bilig*. Ankara: Manevî Cihazlanma Cemiyeti; 1970.
- [22] [21] Kononov AN. The poem of Yūsuf Balasagun Blessed Knowledge. In: Kononov AN, editor, Ivanov SN, translator. *Yūsuf Balasagun. Blessed Knowledge (Wisdom of Royal Glory)*. Moscow: Nauka publ.; 1983. P. 495–517. (In Russian).
- [23] *Кононов А.Н.* Поэма Юсуфа Баласагунского «Благодатное знание» // Юсуф Баласагуни. Благословенное знание (Мудрость царственной славы). М. : Наука. 1983. С. 495–517.
- [24] [22] Egeubaev A. *The great heritage of the Turkish world*. In: Egeubaev A, editor, translator. *Yūsuf Khāṣṣ-Hājib. Qutty bilik*. Almaty: Taymas; 2007. P. 8–55 (In Kazakh).
- [25] [23] Dankoff R. *Introduction to Wisdom of Royal Glory*. In: Dankoff R, translator. *Wisdom of Royal Glory*. A *Turko-Islamic Mirror for Princes*. Chicago: The University of Chicago Press; 1983. P. 1–35.
- [26] [24] Ivanov SN. *About Wisdom of Royal Glory of Yūsuf Balasagun*. In: Kononov AN, editor, Ivanov SN, translator. *Blessed Knowledge by Yūsuf Balasagun*. Moscow: Nauka publ.; 1983. P. 518–538. (In Russian).
- [27] Иванов С.Н. О мудрости и царственной славе Юсуфа Баласагуни // Благословенное знание Юсуфа Баласагуни. М.: Наука, 1983.
- [28] [25] Starr SF. Lost Enlightenment: Central Asia's Golden Age from the Arab Conquest to Tamerlane. Princeton and Oxford: Princeton University Press; 2014.
- [29] [26] Ganieva RK. Eastern Renaissance and poet Kul Gali. Kazan: KGU Publishing House; 1988. (In Russian).
- [30] Ганиева Р.К. Восточный Ренессанс и поэт Кул Гали. Казань : Издательство Казанского университета, 1988.
- [31] [27] Alberts O. Der Dichter des in Uigurisch-Türkischem Dialect geschriebenen Kudatku Bilik (1069–1070) ein Schüler des Avicenna. *Archiv für Geschichte der Philosophie*. 1901;14(3):319–336. Republished by De Gruyter July 22, 2009. https://doi.org/10.1515/agph.1901.14.3.319
- [32] [28] Al-Fārābī A. *Social and ethical treatise*. Khasymzhanov Akh, editor. Alma-Ata: Nauka publ.; 1973. (In Russian).
- [33] Аль-Фараби. Социально-этические трактаты / под ред. А.Х. Касымжанова. Алма-Ата: Наука, 1973.
- [34] [29] Yūsuf Khāṣṣ-Hājib. *Kutadgu Bilig*. Egeubaev A, editor, translator. Almaty: Taĭmas; 2007 (In Kazakh).

- [35] [30] Bonelli M. Farabi's Virtuous City and the Plotinian World Soul: A New Reading of Farabi's "Mabadi'Ara'Ahl Al-Madina Al-Fadila": dissertation for the degree of Doctor of Philosophy. Montreal; 2009.
- [36] [31] Nauruzbayev D, Abzhalov S, Bazarbayev K, Kolukiri S, Amrebayeva Z. The concept of *Justice* in Yūsuf Khāṣṣ-Hājib's Kutadgu Bilig. *The Bulletin of KazNU*. 2023;85(3):15–24. https://doi.org/10.26577/10.26577/jpcp.2023.v.85.i3.03
- [37] [32] Hackett RD, Wang G. Virtues and leadership: An integrating conceptual framework founded in Aristotelian and Confucian perspectives on virtues. *Management Decision*. 2012;(505):868–899. https://doi.org/10.1108/00251741211227564
- [38] [33] Aristotle. *Nicomachean Ethics*. Books II–IV. Taylor C. editor. New York: Oxford University Press; 2006.
- [39] [34] Broadie S, Rowe C. editors. *Aristotle Nicomachean Ethics*. New York: Oxford University Press; 2002.
- [40] [35] Hanbury GL. A 'Pracademic's' Perspective of Ethics and Honor: Imperatives for Public Service in the 21st Century. *Public Organization Review*. 2004;(4):187–204.
- [41] [36] Ryskieva A, Nauruzbaev D, Abzhalov S, Bazarbaev K. The concept of happiness in the works of Abu Nasr Al-Fārābi and Yūsuf Khāṣṣ-Hājib Balasaghun. *Al-Farabi Journal*. 2023;84(4):16–31. (In Kazakh). https://doi.org/10.48010/2023.4/1999-5911.02

About the authors:

Nauruzbayev Darkhan M. — PhD student, Department of Philosophy, al-Farabi Kazakh National University, Almaty, Republic of Kazakhstan (e-mail: nauruzbayevd@bk.ru). ORCID: 0000-0002-7934-4919

Altayev Zhakipbek A. — DSc in Philosophy, Professor, Department of Philosophy, al-Farabi Kazakh National University, Almaty, Republic of Kazakhstan (e-mail: altaev.kaznu@gmail.com). ORCID: 0000-0002-3925-0045

Abdimomynov Nurtas T. — PhD in History, Professor, Department of History of Kazakhstan, al-Farabi Kazakh National University, Almaty, Republic of Kazakhstan (e-mail: nurtas.amirbay@gmail.com). ORCID: 0000-0002-5395-8701

Сведения об авторах:

Наурузбаев Дархан Мирзабекович — докторант по специальности «Политическая философия», кафедра философии, Казахский Национальный университет имени аль-Фараби, Алматы, Республика Казахстан (e-mail: nauruzbayevd@bk.ru). ORCID: 0000-0002-7934-4919

Алтаев Жакыпбек Алтаевич — доктор философских наук, профессор, кафедра философии, Казахский Национальный университет имени аль-Фараби, Алматы, Республика Казахстан (e-mail: altaev.kaznu@gmail.com). ORCID: 0000-0002-3925-0045 Абдимомынов Нуртас Талгатжанович — PhD по специальности история, профессор, кафедра истории Казахстана, Казахский Национальный университет имени аль-Фараби, Алматы, Республика Казахстан (e-mail: nurtas.amirbay@gmail.com). ORCID: 0000-0002-5395-8701